



BY FAX AND E-MAIL

The Secretary,
Town Planning Board,
15th Floor, North Point Government Offices,
333 Java Road,
North Point, Hong Kong
(Fax: 2877 0245 or 2522 8426, E-mail: tpbpd@pland.gov.hk)

3 February, 2016

Dear Sir/ Madam,

**TOWN PLANNING ORDINANCE (Chapter 131)
DRAFT PAK SHA O OUTLINE ZONING PLAN NO. S/NE-PSO/1**

1. **Green Power** is a local charitable green group with river and butterfly conservation being our focused issues. Regarding the above-captioned draft plan (hereafter PSO OZP), we would like to draw your attention to our recommendations and comments on land use planning of river basin of Hoi Ha Ecologically Important Stream (EIS) and protection of natural assets with butterfly as target taxa group in particular.
2. Green Power supports that the “*general planning intention of the Area (the Planning Scheme Area of draft PSO OZP) is to conserve the high natural landscape and ecological significance of the Area in safeguarding the natural habitat and natural system of the wider area.*”(Sec 8.1, Explanatory Statement)
3. We also agree to the planning intention “*to consolidate village development so as to avoid undesirable disturbances to the natural environment and overtaxing the limited infrastructure in the Area*” (Sec 8.1, Explanatory Statement)

Land Use Planning of River Basin

4. Undoubtedly, the pristine Hoi Ha EIS forms an integral and dominant part of the Area in the aspects of hydrology, water quality, ecology and landscape. Thus, the land use of river basin of Hoi Ha EIS in Pak Sha O requires special planning considerations to address the unique functions and characteristics of a river/stream and its ecological connection to Hoi Ha Wan Marine Park (MP).
5. In view of ecological function of Hoi Ha EIS, the EIS section should not be considered as an independent habitat. Instead, the whole river system including upper, middle and lower courses of the mainstream and tributaries, and the Hoi Ha Wan MP should be considered as one whole

ecological system where any change in Hoi Ha EIS must definitely impact Hoi Ha Wan MP.

6. As highlighted in Sec 7.1.1 of the Explanatory Notes, “Many stream tributaries flow through the Area, including a section identified as the Hoi Ha EIS, which is valued for its good water quality and presence of the rare Three-lines Bafrid Fish *Pseudobagrus trilineatus*.” And in Sec 7.2.2.1, “with reference to the ‘Landscape Value Mapping of Hong Kong (2005), the Area is classified as of high quality landscape value of an enclosed, tranquil and coherent landscape character.” Regrettably, the unique land use characteristics of EIS and the high-valued landscape are threatened by the incompatible zoning of “V”.

Conservation through Protection of Butterfly Habitat

7. Pak Sha O is well known for its butterfly diversity. Since 2013, Pak Sha O has been included in our Butterfly Surveyor Programme. Every year, around 20 butterfly surveyors conduct butterfly ecological surveys along a designated route from Pak Sha O until December 2015, 115 butterfly species were recorded which account for 45% of total number of species recorded in Hong Kong. 13 “Rare” species and 8 “Very Rare” species are included. With these high number of species recorded and high proportion of “Rare” and “Very Rare” species, Pak Sha O is undoubtedly a butterfly hotspot. A list of butterfly species aforementioned is enclosed in the Annex.
8. According to the draft PSO OZP, massive areas including the stream banks will be zoned as “GB”. These open areas are important habitats for “Rare” and “Very Rare” butterflies. They nurture countless food plants for many adult butterflies and their caterpillars. Therefore, they are important feeding and breeding habitats of diverse butterfly species.
9. In our opinion, “GB” zone may not reflect the ecological values of these areas, and hence protect the area against incompatible development and vandalized actions. We appeal the Town Planning Board to further consider the status of butterfly ecology of Pak Sha O, and re-zone the “GB” to “CA”.



“Rare” Constable *Dichorragia nesimachus* 電蛺蝶



“Rare” Indian Awl King *Choaspes benjaminii* 綠弄蝶

Particular Comments on the draft PSO OZP

10. In point 8(d) under Notes, public works implemented or coordinated by the Government are always permitted on land falling within the boundaries of the PSO OZP. We are gravely concerned that these works will impose serious impacts during construction or operational phases through diversion/ disturbance of streams, pollution of stream water, clearance of vegetation, waste dumping, etc. These works should be strictly controlled in river channels, river banks and lands with dense vegetation or woodlands.
11. Regarding point 8(c) of Notes, we are concerned that if “*maintenance or repair of,watercourse, nullah, sewer and drain*” are always permitted on land falling within the boundaries of the PSO OZP, the water quality of Hoi Ha EIS will be adversely affected as such activities will generate pollutants such as suspended solids, sewage or even chemicals. Water pollution will seriously impact the ecology of Hoi Ha EIS and Hoi Ha Wan MP. Such activities should be strictly controlled in EIS and at upstream of Marine Park. Same concerns are also applied to point 9(a)(i) and (ii) of Notes that “*maintenanceof watercourse.....*” and “*.....sewage works, drainage works....*” are always permitted in “CA” zone.
12. We agree to Remarks to Village Type Development(“V”) (point (d)), Agriculture(“AGR”), Green Belt(“GB”) and Conservation Area(“CA”) zones to strictly control “*any diversion of streams, filling of land/pond or excavation of land*” in order to protect the Hoi Ha EIS. However, certain sections of the tributaries of Hoi Ha EIS may have been diverged and/or modified as irrigation ditches or converted to wet agricultural farmlands. In such cases, the Remarks in this regard should also be applied to these irrigation ditches and wet agricultural farmlands in order to maintain the drainage capacity, connectivity and hydrology of the EIS to avoid flood, fragmentation of stream ecosystem and alternation of hydrology.
13. In order to avoid pollution to the EIS and MP from village houses sewage, “V” should not be zoned in vicinity to the existing stream courses. We opine that the “V” zone to the north of the existing Pak Sha O village is too extensive and too close to the stream course of EIS which may generate polluted surface runoff from houses, settlements and construction/demolition activities though the boundary of “V” zone is approximately 20m away from the EIS courses.
14. We also urge that no sewage and stormwater outfalls should be drained into any streams at Pak Sha O. The construction on the river banks should be prohibited so as to avoid water pollution to the streams. Also, the use of chemical fertilizers and pesticides should be strictly controlled.
15. The courses and all the banks of natural streams in the Area are zoned as “GB” that may be vulnerable to disturbance and/or destruction by future works and developments. Therefore, we advise to zone all the stream courses and 30 metres of both sides of river banks of all the streams

and tributaries in the Area as “CA”.

16. Maintaining sufficient vegetation cover and permeability is crucial to the hydrology and water quality of Hoi Ha EIS and its ecology because permeable (not concrete-paved) and vegetated land can moderate the flow volume and purify the surface runoff. Therefore, significant portion of the land use in the stream basin of Hoi Ha EIS should be non-polluting and unpaved to prevent pollution to the stream and maintain natural hydrology. However, the “V” zone to the north of the existing Pak Sha O village will extensively reduce vegetation cover and permeability of the river basin.
17. Hoi Ha Wan MP received all the stormwater from the Area through Hoi Ha EIS. However, Hoi Ha Wan is a sheltered bay with limited turnover rate of seawater. Therefore, the carrying capacity of the sheltered Hoi Ha Wan to degrade pollutants collected from the Hoi Ha EIS stream basin, i.e. the Area, should be cautiously considered. And land use of the Area should not generate extra pollution that overload the self-purification capacity of Hoi Ha Wan.

Suspected Fake Exemption House Applications

18. According to the outstanding small house application cases provided by Planning Department, Green Power discovered that the land ownership of the Lot 995, 996, 999RP, 1018RP, 1020 and 1080 was Xinhua Bookstore Xiang Liang Group Limited in 2012. To our understanding, a company is not entitled to apply for New Territories Exemption House.
19. If the ownership of these plots is changed to any valid applicants, we highly suspected that these outstanding small house applications are to mask further developments rather than to fulfill the housing demand of indigenous villagers.
20. We are gravely concerned that such suspected further developments are incompatible to the planning intention of the Area, and the high ecological and landscape value of Pak Sha O. Even worse, such developments are usually difficult to monitor and control in town planning context according to the experiences in other enclaves in the New Territories, such as Pak Lap, Tai Long Wan, Tung Chung West.
21. These developments may also require provision or upgrading of utilities that the related works and operation may cause damage and disturbance to the environment and ecology, especially the Hoi Ha EIS and Hoi Ha Wan MP through habitat loss, water pollution, soil pollution, tree felling, hill fires and flytipping of soil debris and construction and demolish wastes.
22. Pak Sha O has been a shining example of how biodiversity, culture and humanity co-exist and remain in harmony in Hong Kong. More stringent land use regulation and monitoring will be needed for effective and long term protection of the area's natural environment. We urge the

government to include the Pak Sha O enclave in the country park area or even designate the area as a Site of Special Scientific Interest, to prevent further damage.

Should you have any inquiries or need further information, please contact the undersigned at Green Power (T: 3961 0200; Fax:2314 2661, Email: lkcheng@greenpower.org.hk).

Thank you for your kind attention.

Yours faithfully,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Cheng Luk-ki'.

CHENG Luk-ki
Division Head, Scientific Research and Conservation
GREEN POWER

Encl.

Annex. List of butterfly species recorded in Pak Sha O by Green Power's butterfly surveyors

Annex: Species List of Butterfly Survey in Pak Sha O (2013-15) by Green Power

Scientific Name	English name	Chinese name	AFCD Status
<i>Elymnias hypermnestra</i>	Common Palmfly	翠袖鋸眼蝶	C
<i>Lethe confusa</i>	Banded Tree Brown	白帶黛眼蝶	C
<i>Lethe europa</i>	Bamboo Tree Brown	長紋黛眼蝶	UC
<i>Melanitis phedima</i>	Dark Evening Brown	睇暮眼蝶	UC
<i>Mycalesis mineus</i>	Dark-brand Bush Brown	小眉眼蝶	VC
<i>Mycalesis zonata</i>	South China Bush Brown	平頂眉眼蝶	C
<i>Neope muirheadii</i>	Muirhead's Labyrinth	蒙鏈蔭眼蝶	UC
<i>Ypthima baldus</i>	Common Five-ring	雙眼蝶	VC
<i>Ypthima lisandra</i>	Straight Five-ring	黎桑雙眼蝶	C
<i>Discophora sondaica</i>	Common Duffer	鳳眼方環蝶	UC
<i>Faunis eumeus</i>	Large Faun	串珠環蝶	C
<i>Ariadne ariadne</i>	Angled Castor	波蚨蝶	C
<i>Athyma nefte</i>	Colour Sergeant	相思帶蚨蝶	C
<i>Athyma selenophora</i>	Staff Sergeant	新月帶蚨蝶	C
<i>Charaxes bernardus</i>	Tawny Rajah	白帶螯蚨蝶	C
<i>Charaxes marmax</i>	Yellow Rajah	螯蚨蝶	UC
<i>Cupha erymanthis</i>	Rustic	黃襟蚨蝶	VC
<i>Cyrestis thyodamas</i>	Common Mapwing	網絲蚨蝶	C
<i>Dichorragia nesimachus</i>	Constable	電蚨蝶	R
<i>Euripus nyctelius</i>	Courtesan	芒蚨蝶	VR
<i>Euthalia lubentina</i>	Gaudy Baron	紅斑翠蚨蝶	UC
<i>Euthalia phemius</i>	White-edged Blue Baron	尖翅翠蚨蝶	C
<i>Hypolimnas bolina</i>	Great Egg-fly	幻紫斑蚨蝶	C
<i>Hypolimnas misppus</i>	Danaid Egg-fly	金斑蚨蝶	UC
<i>Junonia almana</i>	Peacock Pansy	美眼蚨蝶	C
<i>Junonia atlites</i>	Grey Pansy	波紋眼蚨蝶	C
<i>Junonia iphita</i>	Chocolate Pansy	鈎翅眼蚨蝶	C
<i>Junonia lemonias</i>	Lemon Pansy	蛇眼蚨蝶	C
<i>Kaniska canace</i>	Blue Admiral	琉璃蚨蝶	C
<i>Neptis clinia</i>	Southern Sullied Sailer	珂環蚨蝶	C
<i>Neptis hylas</i>	Common Sailer	中環蚨蝶	VC
<i>Neptis soma</i>	Sullied Sailer	娑環蚨蝶	VR
<i>Pantoporia hordonia</i>	Common Lascar	金蟠蚨蝶	UC
<i>Parasarpa dudu</i>	White Commodore	丫紋俳蚨蝶	C
<i>Parathyma sulphitia</i>	Five-dot Sergeant	殘鏢線蚨蝶	C
<i>Phaedyma columella</i>	Short-banded Sailer	柱菲蚨蝶	C
<i>Polyura nepenthes</i>	Shan Nawab	忘憂尾蚨蝶	UC
<i>Rohana parisatis</i>	Black Prince	羅蚨蝶	C
<i>Symbrenthia lilaea</i>	Common Jester	散紋盛蚨蝶	C

<i>Vanessa indica</i>	Indian Red Admiral	大紅蛺蝶	UC
<i>Danaus chrysippus</i>	Plain Tiger	金斑蝶	UC
<i>Danaus genuita</i>	Common Tiger	虎斑蝶	C
<i>Euploea core</i>	Common Indian Crow	幻紫斑蝶	C
<i>Euploea midamus</i>	Blue-spotted Crow	藍點紫斑蝶	VC
<i>Euploea mulciber</i>	Striped Blue Crow	異型紫斑蝶	UC
<i>Ideopsis similis</i>	Ceylon Blue Glassy Tiger	擬旖斑蝶	VC
<i>Parantica aglea</i>	Glassy Tiger	絹斑蝶	C
<i>Tirumala limniace</i>	Blue Tiger	青斑蝶	C
<i>Tirumala septentrionis</i>	Dark Blue Tiger	靑青斑蝶	VR
<i>Abisara echerius</i>	Plum Judy	蛇目褐蛺蝶	VC
<i>Zemeros flegyas</i>	Punchinello	波蛺蝶	C
<i>Acytolepis puspa</i>	Common Hedge Blue	鈕灰蝶	C
<i>Catochrysops strabo</i>	Forget-me-not	咖灰蝶	VR
<i>Celastrina lavendularis</i>	Plain Hedge Blue	薰衣琉璃灰蝶	VR
<i>Chilades lajus</i>	Lime Blue	紫灰蝶	C
<i>Chilades pandava</i>	Plains Cupid	曲紋紫灰蝶	UC
<i>Curetis dentata</i>	Toothed Sunbeam	尖翅銀灰蝶	UC
<i>Deudorix epijarbas</i>	Cornelian	玳灰蝶	R
<i>Heliophorus epicles</i>	Purple Sapphire	斜斑彩灰蝶	C
<i>Horaga onyx</i>	Common Onyx	斑灰蝶	R
<i>Iraota timoleon</i>	Silver Streak Blue	鐵木萊異灰蝶	UC
<i>Jamides alecto</i>	Metallic Cerulean	素雅灰蝶	VR
<i>Lampides boeticus</i>	Long-tailed Blue, Pea Blue	亮灰蝶	C
<i>Nacaduba kurava</i>	Transparent 6-line Blue	古樓娜灰蝶	C
<i>Rapala manea</i>	Slate Flash	燕灰蝶	C
<i>Spindasis lohita</i>	Long-banded Silverline	銀線灰蝶	C
<i>Spindasis syama</i>	Club Silverline	豆粒銀線灰蝶	UC
<i>Zizeeria karsandra</i>	Dark Grass Blue	吉灰蝶	UC
<i>Zizeeria maha</i>	Pale Grass Blue	酢醬灰蝶	VC
<i>Zizina otis</i>	Lesser Grass Blue	毛眼灰蝶	C
<i>Catopsilia pomona</i>	Lemon Emigrant	遷粉蝶	C
<i>Catopsilia pyranthe</i>	Mottled Emigrant	梨花遷粉蝶	VC
<i>Cepora nerissa</i>	Common Gull	黑脈圍粉蝶	C
<i>Delias hyparete</i>	Painted Jezebel	優越斑粉蝶	UC
<i>Delias pasithoe</i>	Red-base Jezebel	報喜斑粉蝶	VC
<i>Dercas verhuelli</i>	Tailed Sulphur	檀方粉蝶	R
<i>Eurema blanda</i>	Three-spot Grass Yellow	槩黃粉蝶	C
<i>Eurema brigitta</i>	Small Grass Yellow	無標黃粉蝶	R
<i>Eurema hecabe</i>	Common Grass Yellow	寬邊黃粉蝶	VC
<i>Hebomoia glaucippe</i>	Great Orange Tip	鶴頂粉蝶	C
<i>Peris rapae</i>	Small Cabbage White	菜粉蝶	R

<i>Pieris canidia</i>	Indian Cabbage White	東方菜粉蝶	VC
<i>Chilasa clytia</i>	Common Mine	斑鳳蝶	C
<i>Graphium agamemnon</i>	Tailed Jay	統帥青鳳蝶	C
<i>Graphium doson</i>	Common Jay	木蘭青鳳蝶	C
<i>Graphium sarpedon</i>	Common Bluebottle	青鳳蝶	VC
<i>Papilio bianor</i>	Chinese Peacock	碧鳳蝶	C
<i>Papilio helenus</i>	Red Helen	玉斑鳳蝶	VC
<i>Papilio memnon</i>	Great Mormon	美鳳蝶	VC
<i>Papilio paris</i>	Paris Peacock	巴黎翠鳳蝶	VC
<i>Papilio polytes</i>	Common Mormon	玉帶鳳蝶	VC
<i>Papilio protenor</i>	Spangle	藍鳳蝶	VC
<i>Aeromachus jhora</i>	Jhora Scrub Hopper	寬鏢弄蝶	R
<i>Aeromachus pygmaeus</i>	Pigmy Scrub Hopper	侏儒鏢弄蝶	VR
<i>Ampittia dioscorides</i>	Bush Hopper	黃斑弄蝶	UC
<i>Astictopterus jama</i>	Forest Hopper	腌翅弄蝶	C
<i>Bibasis gomata</i>	Pale Awlet	白傘弄蝶	UC
<i>Borbo cinnara</i>	Formosan Swift	杉弄蝶	C
<i>Caltoris cahira</i>	Dark Swift	放踵珂弄蝶	R
<i>Choaspes benjaminii</i>	Indian Awl King	綠弄蝶	VR
<i>Hyarotis adrastus</i>	Tree Flitter	希弄蝶	UC
<i>Iambrix salsala</i>	Chestnut Bob	雅弄蝶	UC
<i>Notocrypta curvifascia</i>	Restricted Demon	曲紋袖弄蝶	UC
<i>Parnara bada</i>	Oriental Straight Swift	么紋稻弄蝶	R
<i>Parnara ganga</i>	Rare Swift	曲紋稻弄蝶	UC
<i>Parnara guttata</i>	Common Straight Swift	直紋稻弄蝶	C
<i>Pelopidas agna</i>	Little Branded Swift	南亞穀弄蝶	UC
<i>Pelopidas assamensis</i>	Great Swift	印度穀弄蝶	R
<i>Pelopidas conjunctus</i>	Conjoined Swift	古銅穀弄蝶	R
<i>Polytremis lubricans</i>	Contiguous Swift	黃紋孔弄蝶	C
<i>Potanthus trachala</i>	Lesser Band Dart	斷紋黃室弄蝶	R
<i>Suastus gremius</i>	Indian Palm Bob	素弄蝶	UC
<i>Tagiades litigiousus</i>	Water Snow Flat	沾邊裙弄蝶	C
<i>Tagiades menaka</i>	Dark Edged Snow Flat	黑邊裙弄蝶	UC
<i>Zographetus satwa</i>	Purple and Gold Flitter	黃裳腫脈弄蝶	R

AFCD Status	No of species
VC	18
C	49
UC	27
R	13
VR	8
Total	115